

PARTNERS ON CAIR/ TRANSPORT

ATI V. EPA
(SIERRA CLUB/ALA EMAIL)
PRODUCTIONS AS OF
12/23/13

Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US

Sent by: Teri Porterfield

03/30/2010 10:45 AM

To: Brian Mclean, Janet McCabe, Joseph Goffman, Peter Tsirigotis, Rob Brenner, Robert Wayland, Sam Napolitano, Sonja Rodman, Steve Page
cc: Cindy Huang, Don Zinger, Donald Maddox, Drew McConville, Jeffrey Clark, Marjean Gleaton, Ross Natoli
bcc:

Subject: Discuss Transport Rule w/Enviros

Meeting

Date: 04/08/2010

Time: 12:00:00 PM to 01:00:00 PM

Chair: Gina McCarthy

Invitees:

Required: Brian Mclean; Janet McCabe; Joseph Goffman; Peter Tsirigotis; Rob Brenner; RobertJ Wayland; Sam Napolitano; Sonja Rodman; Steve Page

Optional: Cindy Huang; Don Zinger; Donald Maddox; Drew McConville; Jeffrey Clark; Marjean Gleaton; Ross Natoli

FYI

Location: 5400 ARN Call In # [REDACTED]

POC: Janice Nolen - 202-715-3444

From: Janice Nolen <JNolen@lungusa.org>
To: Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Shela Poke-Williams/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Janet McCabe/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rob Brenner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Jwalke@nrdc.org" <Jwalke@nrdc.org>, Vickie Patton <vpatt@edf.org>, Mark MacLeod <mmacleod@edf.org>, "dbaron@earthjustice.org" <dbaron@earthjustice.org>, Paul Billings <PBillings@lungusa.org>, James Pew <jpew@earthjustice.org>, "Conrad Schneider (cschneider@catf.us)" <cschneider@catf.us>, Steve Page/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 03/15/2010 11:57 AM
Subject: Requesting a meeting to discuss CAIR

Hello, Gina,

We and our colleagues in the environmental community appreciate the willingness you and your staff have shown to talk with us on many issues. We would like to schedule a meeting with you to discuss the CAIR replacement rule under development. We understand you are hoping to announce something next month.

Thank you,
Janice Nolen

Janice E. Nolen
Assistant Vice President
National Policy and Advocacy
American Lung Association
jnolen@LungUSA.org
1301 Pennsylvania Ave NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20004-1725

Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US

To

Sent by: Teri Porterfield

cc

bcc

03/30/2010 02:23 PM

Subject: Discuss Transport Rule w/Enviros

Meeting

Date 04/08/2010

Time 12:00:00 PM to 01:00:00 PM

Chair Gina McCarthy

Invitees

Required Brian Mclean; Janet McCabe; Joseph Goffman; Peter Tsirigotis; Rob Brenner; Robert J Wayland; Sam Napolitano; Sonja Rodman; Steve Page

Optional Cindy Huang; Don Zinger; Donald Maddox; Drew McConville; Jeffrey Clark; Marjean Gleaton; Ross Natoli

FYI

Location 5415 ARN Call In # [REDACTED]

#

POC: Janice Nolen - 202-715-3444

Here is the final list of participants for tomorrow's meeting with Gina McCarthy.

Attending in person will be:

- Janice Nolen, American Lung Association
- Paul Billings, American Lung Association
- David Baron, Earthjustice
- Jim Pew, Earthjustice
- Ann Weeks, Clean Air Task Force
- Mark MacLeod, Environmental Defense Fund
- Frank O'Donnell, Clean Air Watch

Attending by phone will be:

- John Walke, NRDC
- Vickie Patton, Environmental Defense Fund
- Conrad Schneider, Clean Air Task Force

From: Janice Nolen <JNolen@lungusa.org>

To: Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US@EPA

Cc: Shela Poke-Williams/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Janet McCabe/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rob Brenner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Jwalke@nrdc.org" <Jwalke@nrdc.org>, Vickie Patton <vpatton@edf.org>, Mark MacLeod <mmacleod@edf.org>, "dbaron@earthjustice.org" <dbaron@earthjustice.org>, Paul Billings <PBillings@lungusa.org>, James Pew <jpew@earthjustice.org>, "Conrad Schneider (cschneider@catf.us)" <cschneider@catf.us>, Steve Page/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 03/15/2010 11:57 AM

Subject: Requesting a meeting to discuss CAIR

Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US

Sent by: Cindy Huang

04/06/2010 10:20 AM

To Brian Mclean, Janet McCabe, Joseph Goffman, Peter Tsirigotis, Rob Brenner, RobertJ Wayland, Sam Napolitano, Sonja Rodman, Steve Page

cc Cindy Huang, Don Zinger, Donald Maddox, Drew McConville, Jeffrey Clark, Marjean Gleaton, Ross Natoli

bcc

Subject Rescheduled: Discuss Transport Rule w/Enviros (Apr 8 12:00 PM EDT in 5400 ARN Call In # 866- Access: 202

POC: Janice Nolen - 202-715-3444

From: Janice Nolen <JNolen@lungusa.org>
To: Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Shela Poke-Williams/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Janet McCabe/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rob Brenner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Jwalke@nrdc.org" <Jwalke@nrdc.org>, Vickie Patton <vpattson@edf.org>, Mark MacLeod <mmacleod@edf.org>, "dbaron@earthjustice.org" <dbaron@earthjustice.org>, Paul Billings <PBillings@lungusa.org>, James Pew <jpew@earthjustice.org>, "Conrad Schneider (cschneider@catf.us)" <cschneider@catf.us>, Steve Page/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 03/15/2010 11:57 AM
Subject: Requesting a meeting to discuss CAIR

Hello, Gina,

We and our colleagues in the environmental community appreciate the willingness you and your staff have shown to talk with us on many issues. We would like to schedule a meeting with you to discuss the CAIR replacement rule under development. We understand you are hoping to announce something next month.

Thank you,
Janice Nolen

Janice E. Nolen
Assistant Vice President
National Policy and Advocacy
American Lung Association
jnolen@LungUSA.org
1301 Pennsylvania Ave NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20004-1725

Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US

Sent by: Cindy Huang

04/08/2010 11:15 AM

To Brian Mclean, Janet McCabe, Jim Ketcham-Colwill, Joseph Goffman, Peter Tsirigotis, RobertJ Wayland, Sam Napolitano, Sonja Rodman, Steve Page

cc Cindy Huang, Don Zinger, Donald Maddox, Drew McConville, Jeffrey Clark, Marjean Gleaton, Ross Natoli

bcc

Subject Information Update - Location has changed: Discuss Transport Rule w/Enviros

POC: Janice Nolen - 202-715-3444

Here is the final list of participants for tomorrow's meeting with Gina McCarthy.

Attending in person will be:

- Janice Nolen, American Lung Association
- Paul Billings, American Lung Association
- David Baron, Earthjustice
- Jim Pew, Earthjustice
- Ann Weeks , Clean Air Task Force
- Mark MacLeod, Environmental Defense Fund
- Frank O'Donnell, Clean Air Watch

Attending by phone will be:

- John Walke, NRDC
- Vickie Patton, Environmental Defense Fund
- Conrad Schneider, , Clean Air Task Force

From: Janice Nolen <JNolen@lungusa.org>
To: Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Shela Poke-Williams/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Janet McCabe/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rob Brenner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Jwalke@nrdc.org" <Jwalke@nrdc.org>, Vickie Patton <vpatton@edf.org>, Mark MacLeod <mmacleod@edf.org>, "dbaron@earthjustice.org" <dbaron@earthjustice.org>, Paul Billings <PBillings@lungusa.org>, James Pew <jpew@earthjustice.org>, "Conrad Schneider (cschneider@catf.us)" <cschneider@catf.us>, Steve Page/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 03/15/2010 11:57 AM
Subject: Requesting a meeting to discuss CAIR

Hello, Gina,

We and our colleagues in the environmental community appreciate the willingness you and your staff have shown to talk with us on many issues. We would like to schedule a meeting with you to discuss the CAIR replacement rule under development. We understand you are hoping to announce something next month.

Thank you,
Janice Nolen

Janice E. Nolen
Assistant Vice President
National Policy and Advocacy
American Lung Association
jnolen@LungUSA.org
1301 Pennsylvania Ave NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20004-1725

Gina McCarthy/DC/USEPA/US

Sent by: Cindy Huang

04/15/2010 05:18 PM

To Brian Mclean, Janet McCabe, JNolen, John Millett, Joseph Goffman, Peter Tsirigotis, Rob Brenner, Stephen Harper
cc Barbara Morris, Don Zinger, Donald Maddox, Drew McConville, Gail-R Jones, Jackie Krieger, Jean Walker, Lala Alston, Marjean Gleaton, Ross Natoli, Steve Page, Teri Porterfield, Tina Murphy

bcc

Subject Discussion with Enviros

Meeting

Date 04/23/2010

Time 10:30:00 AM to 11:30:00 AM

Chair Gina McCarthy

Invitees

Required Brian Mclean; Janet McCabe; JNolen; John Millett; Joseph Goffman; Peter Tsirigotis; Rob Brenner; Stephen Harper

Optional Barbara Morris; Don Zinger; Donald Maddox; Drew McConville; Gail-R Jones; Jackie Krieger; Jean Walker; Lala Alston; Marjean Gleaton; Ross Natoli; Steve Page; Teri Porterfield; Tina Murphy

FYI

Location ARN 5415

Conference 1-866-2-8 Access:
202

To discuss MACT and public health

Hi Ellen,

Here's a list of participants in the meeting with Gina McCarthy at 10:30 on April 23:

Paul Billings, American Lung Association pbillings@lungusa.org
Janice Nolen, American Lung Association jnolen@lungusa.org
David Baron, Earthjustice dbaron@earthjustice.org
John Walke, NRDC jwalke@nrdc.org
Ann Weeks, Clean Air Task Force aweeks@catf.us
Bruce Nilles, Sierra Club Bruce.Nilles@sierraclub.org
Joining by phone: Vickie Patton, Environmental Defense Fund vpatton@edf.org
(possibly by phone) Conrad Schneider, CATF cschneider@catf.us

Unable to attend: Jim Pew, Earthjustice
Frank O'Donnell, Clean Air Watch

I've sent them all appointments for their calendars, so if you want to send me the phone in number, I'll share it with them. Thanks!

Janice E. Nolen
Assistant Vice President
National Policy and Advocacy
American Lung Association
jnolen@LungUSA.org
1301 Pennsylvania Ave NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20004-1725
P 202-785-3355
C 202-486-0285
F 202-452-1805

Sam
Napolitano/DC/USEPA/US
05/17/2010 07:14 PM

To Richard Wayland, Tim Smith, Norm Possiel, Kevin Culligan,
Sonja Rodman
cc Joseph Goffman, Brian Mclean
bcc
Subject OMB's Meeting with Enviros and Clean Energy Group Today
on the Transport Rule

There were two 45-minute meetings today where OMB heard from the Environmental Community and the Clean Energy Group on their views of the Transport Rule Proposal. OMB asked a lot questions to clarify and better understand points each group made. The organizations there, and their main points are summarized below. OMB had a half dozen managers and staff there with Heidi King, our main examiner, running the meetings. OPEI's David Evans and myself listened by phone (only option for us).

Enviros - Representatives were at NEOB and on the phone from NRDC, ED, Earth Justice, Sierra Club, and Clean Air Task Force. They indicated that they had not seen the rule, but had some sense of it. Three main points were: (1) would like to see it proposed soon as possible since that will ensure its first phase in 2012 could happen, (2) see potential for tremendous benefits, especially from SO2 control, and hope that we are being as stringent as we can, and (3) hopeful that the package doesn't make CAIR's mistake of having ancillary actions, like having the new rule equal RACT or BART. They made a strong constructive case for the rule going out now. Did mention that this rule was leading the way for the Utility MACT effort which should have even greater benefits resulting from it.

CEG - Representatives were at NEOB, including Michael Bradley and his staff attorney Carrie Jenks, and company reps from FPL, Entergy, PSEG NJ, Calpine, and Constellation Energy. Noted that they wanted to be supportive of rule that resolved the air emissions transport problem, as many CEG members are in downwind areas and have done a lot to operate cleanly already. Made point that how allowances are awarded for NOx and SO2 matters a lot to them and hopeful that we are moving away from approaches that led to CAIR litigation on fuel factors - which unfairly awarded allowances to relatively high emitters of NOx and provided the wrong incentives - which the Court squarely knocked down. Made pitch for trying to use a creative voluntary allowance trade in approach for the current SO2 bank that Constellation had presented to EPA. After OMB, they made same presentation later today to Joe Goffman and myself. (Can email it to you if you want it.)

Notably, on this Thursday at 3:00, OCIR has arranged for a conference call to discuss OAR's "no federalism implications" determination on the proposed Transport rule. Reps from the National Governors Association (NGA), National Conference of State Legislatures (NCSL) and the Environmental Council of States (ECOS) will participate.

Sherry
Russell/RTP/USEPA/US
07/13/2010 09:29 AM

To Brian Timin, Gabrielle Stevens, Gobeail McKinley, Janet McCabe, Jim Ketcham-Colwill, Kevin Culligan, Lora Strine, Lydia Wegman, Meg Victor, Rhea Jones, Richard Haeuber, Richard Wayland, Sam Napolitano, Sara Schneeberg, Scott Mathias, Sonja Rodman, Tamara Saltman, Tim Smith
cc Jan Cortelyou-Lee, Jenny Noonan, Joseph Goffman, Steve Page

bcc

Subject Declined: Special EPA Briefing for Enviros on the Transport Rule - Call-in # [REDACTED]
(Conference Room - 300A for RTP Participants)

From: Conrad Schneider <cschneider@catf.us>
To: Sam Napolitano/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Joseph Goffman/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 07/12/2010 06:56 PM
Subject: Fwd: Special EPA briefing for enviros on Transport Rule

Hi Joe and Sam-

Thank you both so much for agreeing to brief my environmental colleagues on the proposed Transport Rule this Thursday, July 15 at 2 p.m. at the DC office of the American Lung Association. Thanks also to Joe for being willing to call in from London at what will be evening for him. Here is the call-in number for the meeting for Joe and anyone else from EPA that needs to attend via phone:

Phone #: [REDACTED]

Talk to you then.

Thanks,
CS

Conrad G. Schneider
Advocacy Director
Clean Air Task Force
cschneider@catf.us
www.catf.us
169 Park Row
Brunswick, Maine 04011
207/721-8676
207/721-8696 (facsimile)

Begin forwarded message:

From: Paul Billings <PBillings@lungusa.org>

Date: July 12, 2010 4:29:20 PM EDT

To: 'Vickie Patton' <vpatton@edf.org>, "'cschneider@catf.us'" <cschneider@catf.us>, 'John Coequyt' <John.Coequyt@sierraclub.org>, 'Lyndsay Moseley' <Lyndsay.Moseley@sierraclub.org>, Janice Nolen <JNolen@lungusa.org>, Mark MacLeod <mmacleod@edf.org>, "'aweeks@catf.us'" <aweeks@catf.us>, Joanne Spalding <Joanne.Spalding@sierraclub.org>, "'cleanairfrank@cleanairwatch.org'" <cleanairfrank@cleanairwatch.org>, "'dbaron@earthjustice.org'" <dbaron@earthjustice.org>, 'Mark Wenzler' <mwenzler@npca.org>, "'dmarshall@catf.us'" <dmarshall@catf.us>, "'jwalke@nrdc.org'" <jwalke@nrdc.org>

Subject: Special EPA briefing for enviros on Transport Rule

Conrad Schneider has arranged for Sam Napolitano and Joe Goffman to brief us in depth on the Transport Rule on at 2:00 EDT Thursday July15 at the American Lung Association 1301 Pennsylvania Ave NW Suite 800 and by phone for out of towners Phone #: 713-481-0080
[REDACTED]

We intend to keep this small and private but if there are others who should be included, please let me know and we will be glad to include them.

Cheers
Paul

Paul Billings
202-785-3355

Sam
Napolitano/DC/USEPA/US
07/14/2010 05:38 PM

To Conrad Schneider
cc Joseph Goffman, Kevin Culligan, Jim Ketcham-Colwill, Sonja
Rodman, Norm Possiel, Lora Strine, Brian Timin
bcc
Subject Re: Fwd: Special EPA briefing for enviros on Transport Rule

Conrad:

Here are our briefing materials for tomorrow. We will brief you from the first attachment (and go over the second one if anyone has questions). Joe will start the session; then we will jump right to the third section of presentation with Kevin Culligan and Sonja who will come over to ALA - that is the heart of the talk and they have to leave by 3. I will go over the first two sections of the briefing as questions warrant, but i think little of it will need explanation to your group. OAQPS will attend by phone.

Sara Schneeberg will also be there from OGC. Jim Ketcham-Colwill should be there from Gina's immediate office.

We look forward to sitting down with you tomorrow.

Sam



TR Presentation final -- web version.pptx



C&AIR Compariso Slides071210.pptx

Conrad Schneider Hi Joe and Sam- Thank you both so... 07/12/2010 06:56:23 PM

From: Conrad Schneider <cschneider@catf.us>
To: Sam Napolitano/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Joseph Goffman/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 07/12/2010 06:56 PM
Subject: Fwd: Special EPA briefing for enviros on Transport Rule

Hi Joe and Sam-

Thank you both so much for agreeing to brief my environmental colleagues on the proposed Transport Rule this Thursday, July 15 at 2 p.m. at the DC office of the American Lung Association. Thanks also to Joe for being willing to call in from London at what will be evening for him. Here is the call-in number for the meeting for Joe and anyone else from EPA that needs to attend via phone:

Phone #: 713-481-0080 Conferee: [REDACTED]

Talk to you then.

Thanks,
CS

Conrad G. Schneider
Advocacy Director
Clean Air Task Force
cschneider@catf.us

www.catf.us
169 Park Row
Brunswick, Maine 04011
207/721-8676
207/721-8696 (facsimile)

Begin forwarded message:

From: Paul Billings <PBillings@lungusa.org>

Date: July 12, 2010 4:29:20 PM EDT

To: 'Vickie Patton' <vpatton@edf.org>, "cschneider@catf.us" <cschneider@catf.us>, 'John Coequyt' <John.Coequyt@sierraclub.org>, 'Lyndsay Moseley' <Lyndsay.Moseley@sierraclub.org>, Janice Nolen <JNolen@lungusa.org>, Mark MacLeod <mmacleod@edf.org>, "aweeks@catf.us" <aweeks@catf.us>, Joanne Spalding <Joanne.Spalding@sierraclub.org>, "cleanairfrank@cleanairwatch.org" <cleanairfrank@cleanairwatch.org>, "dbaron@earthjustice.org" <dbaron@earthjustice.org>, 'Mark Wenzler' <mwenzler@npca.org>, "dmarshall@catf.us" <dmarshall@catf.us>, "jwalke@nrdc.org" <jwalke@nrdc.org>

Subject: Special EPA briefing for enviros on Transport Rule

Conrad Schneider has arranged for Sam Napolitano and Joe Goffman to brief us in depth on the Transport Rule on at 2:00 EDT Thursday July15 at the American Lung Association 1301 Pennsylvania Ave NW Suite 800 and by phone for out of towners Phone #: 713-481-0080 Conferee: 8095285

We intend to keep this small and private but if there are others who should be included, please let me know and we will be glad to include them.

Cheers
Paul

Paul Billings
202-785-3355