

**To:** Bernard Stewart[Bernard.Stewart@SESIAHS.HEALTH.NSW.GOV.AU]; Caldwell, Jane[Caldwell.Jane@epa.gov]; Kavlock, Robert[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov]; 'Paul Lambert'[plambert@wisc.edu]; DeMarini, David[DeMarini.David@epa.gov]; Cogliano, Vincent[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov]; bucher@niehs.nih.gov[bucher@niehs.nih.gov]; 'Chris Portier'[cportier@me.com]; Gibbons, Catherine[Gibbons.Catherine@epa.gov]; 'Kate Guyton'[GuytonK@iarc.fr]; Fritz, Jason[Fritz.Jason@epa.gov]; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu[lambert@oncology.wisc.edu]; hecht002@umn.edu[hecht002@umn.edu]; 'Robert Baan'[BaanR@iarc.fr]; 'Kurt Straif'[straifk@iarc.fr]; 'Rusyn, Ivan'[IRusyn@cvm.tamu.edu]  
**Cc:** Martyn Smith[martynts@berkeley.edu]  
**From:** Martyn Smith  
**Sent:** Fri 7/3/2015 10:13:23 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Revision of EHP ms 15-09912-REV  
Key Characteristics of Carcinogens 7-3-15 tracked.docx

Dear all

I have revised the paper again in light of all your very helpful comments. Everyone who responded provided substantial and useful edits and I have tried to incorporate as many as possible. I've also had to make some cuts to the text as many of you added but didn't take away and so we are still somewhat over the word limit. Attached then is the final draft that I will upload to EHP on Monday evening unless further changes are suggested.

I am currently working further on the Response to the Reviewers now that I've made all the edits and will distribute that document again on Monday.

Thanks to everyone in helping me bring this fruition and for your outstanding support throughout.

Happy 4th to my American colleagues and best to all,

Martyn

On 7/3/15, 12:25 AM, "Bernard Stewart"  
<Bernard.Stewart@SESIAHS.HEALTH.NSW.GOV.AU> wrote:

>Dear All,  
>  
>Thanks Martyn. The revised manuscript looks fine to me and the responses  
>to reviewers, as you've drafted them, are both lucid and comprehensive.  
>  
>I endorse Jane's and David's insertion of reference to the recent  
>Carcinogenesis reviews in paragraph 2. For consideration (and  
>acknowledging the word count barrier), I've added in that same paragraph  
>a mention of Westcott et al (Nature 517:489-92, 2015) as indicating the  
>evolving biological complexity of chemical carcinogenesis.  
>  
>No other proposal.  
>  
>Regards  
>Bernard.  
>  
>-----Original Message-----  
>From: Caldwell, Jane [mailto:Caldwell.Jane@epa.gov]  
>Sent: Thursday, 2 July 2015 10:55 AM  
>To: Martyn Smith; Kavlock, Robert; 'Paul Lambert'; DeMarini, David;

>Cogliano, Vincent; bucher@niehs.nih.gov; 'Chris Portier'; Gibbons,  
>Catherine; 'Kate Guyton'; Fritz, Jason; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu;  
>hecht002@umn.edu; 'Robert Baan'; 'Kurt Straif'; 'Rusyn, Ivan'; Bernard  
>Stewart  
>Subject: RE: Revision of EHP ms 15-09912-REV  
>  
>  
>Dear All again,  
>  
>Please replace with the version just sent with this one that had just a  
>few more very minor changes. Attached is the correct version (i.e., Key  
>Characteristics of Carcinogens 6-29-15 tracked kczg DD and Caldwell  
>(3).docx.  
>  
>Jane Caldwell  
>  
>  
>-----Original Message-----  
>From: Martyn Smith [mailto:martynts@berkeley.edu]  
>Sent: Monday, June 29, 2015 8:38 PM  
>To: Caldwell, Jane; Kavlock, Robert; 'Paul Lambert'; DeMarini, David;  
>Cogliano, Vincent; bucher@niehs.nih.gov; 'Chris Portier'; Gibbons,  
>Catherine; 'Kate Guyton'; Fritz, Jason; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu;  
>hecht002@umn.edu; 'Robert Baan'; 'Kurt Straif'; 'Rusyn, Ivan';  
>Bernard.Stewart@SESHS.HEALTH.NSW.GOV.AU  
>Cc: martynts@berkeley.edu  
>Subject: Revision of EHP ms 15-09912-REV  
>  
>Dear all  
>  
>I have significantly revised the EHP paper on the key characteristics to  
>respond to the Reviewer's comments and your proposed edits. I attach a  
>version with tracked changes and the other with them accepted. I also  
>attach a draft of our response to the reviewers. I would greatly  
>appreciate your comments on these revisions by Friday morning 8 am PST,  
>Berkeley time so that I can submit the revision to EHP before the July 4  
>Holiday weekend. If I don't hear from you by then I will assume that you  
>are OK with all the revisions. You can send comments on any of the  
>documents attached.  
>  
>Thanks for your patience on this resubmission and for your continued  
>involvement.  
>  
>Best regards,  
>  
>Martyn  
>  
>Martyn T. Smith, Ph.D.  
>Professor & Director, Superfund Research Program, Division of  
>Environmental Health Sciences, School of Public Health Li Ka Shing Center  
>University of California Berkeley, California 94720-7360  
>(510) 642-8770 tel / (510) 642-0427 fax  
>(510) 334-1222 (cell)  
>(510) 643-5100 (assistant)  
>email: martynts@berkeley.edu  
>Web: <http://www.martyntsmith.com>

>-----  
>This message and its attachments are strictly confidential. If you are  
>not the intended recipient of this message, please immediately notify the  
>sender and delete it. Since its integrity cannot be guaranteed, its  
>content cannot involve the sender's responsibility. Any misuse, any  
>disclosure or publication of its content, either whole or partial, is  
>prohibited, exception made of formally approved use.  
>-----  
>  
>  
>  
>-----  
>-----  
>  
>Illawarra Shoalhaven Local Health District, South East Sydney Local  
>Health District and Sydney Children's Hospital Network (Randwick Campus)  
>Confidentiality Notice  
>  
>This email, and the files transmitted with it, are confidential and  
>intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are  
>addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, you are not permitted  
>to distribute or use this email or any of its attachments in any way. We  
>also request that you advise the sender of the incorrect addressing.  
>  
>This email message has been virus-scanned. Although no computer viruses  
>were detected, Illawarra Shoalhaven Local Health District, South East  
>Sydney Local Health District and Sydney Children's Hospital Network  
>(Randwick Campus) accept no liability for any consequential damage  
>resulting from email containing any computer viruses.  
>  
>We care for our environment. Please only print this e-mail if necessary.